<u>Gwendal Jouneaux</u><sup>1</sup> Damian Frölich <sup>3</sup> Olivier Barais <sup>1</sup> Benoit Combemale <sup>1</sup> Gurvan Le Guernic <sup>2 4</sup> Gunter Mussbacher <sup>2 5</sup> L. Thomas van Binsbergen <sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Univ. Rennes – Rennes, France <sup>2</sup>Inria – Rennes, France

<sup>3</sup>University of Amsterdam – Amsterdam, The Netherlands

<sup>4</sup>DGA Maîtrise de IInformation – Rennes, France

<sup>5</sup>McGill University – Montreal, Canada



#### SLE'23 — October 23, 2023



Adaptive Structural Operational Semantics - Jouneaux et al.

Motivation			
000000			

#### Context

Software ...



Motivation • 000000			
Context			

Software ...

Evolve in complex/changing environment (e.g, IoT, embedded systems)



#### Context

DiverSE

Software ...

- Evolve in complex/changing environment (e.g, IoT, embedded systems)
- Need dynamic adaptation to best deliver the service (e.g., Waymo<sup>1</sup>, Netflix<sup>1</sup>)

<sup>1</sup> Cf. https://waymo.com, https://www.netflix.com

## Context

Motivation

Software ...

- Evolve in complex/changing environment (e.g, IoT, embedded systems)
- Need dynamic adaptation to best deliver the service (e.g., Waymo<sup>1</sup>, Netflix<sup>1</sup>)

# Consequence : There is a need to provide abstraction for self-adaption when it's a secondary but important concern

<sup>1</sup> Cf. https://waymo.com, https://www.netflix.com



SOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

#### Abstraction for self-adaptation

Problem studied in the Self-Adaptive Systems community (e.g. SEAMS<sup>2</sup>)

<sup>2</sup> Software Engineering for Adaptive and Self-Managing Systems



SOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

valuation

Conclusion

#### Abstraction for self-adaptation

Problem studied in the Self-Adaptive Systems community (e.g. SEAMS<sup>2</sup>)

Architectural solutions (e.g. MAPE-K<sup>3</sup>, 3 Layer Architecture<sup>4</sup>, MORPH<sup>5</sup>)

<sup>3</sup> J. O. Kephart and D. M. Chess, "The vision of autonomic computing," *Computer*, vol. 36, no. 1, pp. 41–50, Jan. 2003, ISSN: 1558-0814
<sup>4</sup> J. Kramer and J. Magee, "Self-managed systems: An architectural challenge," in *Future of Software Engineering (FOSE'07)*, IEEE, 2007, pp. 259–268
<sup>5</sup> V. Breherman, N. D'Inselite, J. Kramer et al., "Merrip: A reference architecture for configuration and behaviour."

<sup>5</sup> V. Braberman, N. D'Ippolito, J. Kramer, *et al.*, "Morph: A reference architecture for configuration and behaviour self-adaptation," in *Proceedings of the 1st International Workshop on Control Theory for Software Engineering*, 2015, pp. 9–16



SOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

valuation

Conclusion

#### Abstraction for self-adaptation

Problem studied in the Self-Adaptive Systems community (e.g. SEAMS<sup>2</sup>)

- Architectural solutions (e.g. MAPE-K<sup>3</sup>, 3 Layer Architecture<sup>4</sup>, MORPH<sup>5</sup>)
- Frameworks (e.g. Executable Runtime Megamodels<sup>6</sup>, DCL<sup>7</sup>, Ponder2<sup>8</sup>)

<sup>6</sup> T. Vogel and H. Giese, "A language for feedback loops in self-adaptive systems: Executable runtime megamodels," in *2012 7th International Symposium on Software Engineering for Adaptive and Self-Managing Systems (SEAMS)*, IEEE, 2012, pp. 129–138

<sup>7</sup> H. Nakagawa, A. Ohsuga, and S. Honiden, "Towards dynamic evolution of self-adaptive systems based on dynamic updating of control loops," in *2012 IEEE Sixth International Conference on Self-Adaptive and Self-Organizing Systems*, IEEE, 2012, pp. 59–68

<sup>8</sup> K. Twidle, N. Dulay, E. Lupu, *et al.*, "Ponder2: A policy system for autonomous pervasive environments," in *2009 Fifth International Conference on Autonomic and Autonomous Systems*, IEEE, 2009, pp. 330–335



SOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

#### Abstraction for self-adaptation

Problem studied in the Self-Adaptive Systems community (e.g. SEAMS<sup>2</sup>)

- Architectural solutions (e.g. MAPE-K<sup>3</sup>, 3 Layer Architecture<sup>4</sup>, MORPH<sup>5</sup>)
- Frameworks (e.g. Executable Runtime Megamodels<sup>6</sup>, DCL<sup>7</sup>, Ponder2<sup>8</sup>)

#### Yes, but I already/want to have a nice DSL tailored to my domain



SOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

#### DSLs and self-adaptation

DSLs are tools for experts with appropriate constructs for a given domain.

What if self-adaptation is not a primary concern ?



SOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

#### DSLs and self-adaptation

DSLs are tools for experts with appropriate constructs for a given domain.

What if self-adaptation is not a primary concern ?

Re-implementation of frameworks tedious or impossible



SOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

#### DSLs and self-adaptation

DSLs are tools for experts with appropriate constructs for a given domain.

What if self-adaptation is **not** a primary concern ?

- Re-implementation of frameworks tedious or impossible
- Require expertise in self-adaptation from the language users



DiverSE

#### DSLs and self-adaptation

DSLs are tools for experts with appropriate constructs for a given domain.

What if self-adaptation is not a primary concern ?

- Re-implementation of frameworks tedious or impossible
- Require expertise in self-adaptation from the language users

Example of RobLANG :

- Procedural DSL to program robot missions
- Abstraction for robot sensors and actuators
- For instance, we might want to adapt the robot's speed to save energy

```
Motivation
```

DiverSE

Adaptive Structural Operational Semantics

ASOS Semantics

Conclusion

## Manual Implementation of Adaptations (1)

```
void adapt (double energy, double time) {
2
       double tradeoffguarter = energy * 0.984375 + time * -0.75
3
       double tradeoffhalf = energy * 0.875 + time * -0.5
4
       double tradeoffthreequarter = energy * 0.578125 + time * -0.25
5
6
       if tradeoffguarter < tradeoffhalf {
7
           if tradeoffhalf < tradeoffthreequarter {
8
               setSpeed(0.0 < tradeoffthreequarter ? MAX SPEED * 0.75 : MAX SPEED)
9
             else {
10
               setSpeed(0.0 < tradeoffhalf ? MAX SPEED * 0.5 : MAX SPEED)
11
12
         else
13
           if tradeoffguarter < tradeoffthreeguarter {
14
               setSpeed (0.0 < tradeoffthreequarter ? normalSpeed * 0.75 : MAX SPEED)
15
             else {
               setSpeed(0.0 < tradeoffquarter ? MAX_SPEED * 0.25 : MAX_SPEED)</pre>
16
17
18
19
```

ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

#### Manual Implementation of Adaptations (2)

For each system, manually designed adaptation requires:

- Expertise to design the system
- Manual implementation of the trade-off reasoning
- To be correctly integrated to the existing code base.

Motivation	
0000000	

ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantic

Evaluat

Conclusio

#### Is it the end?



SOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

## Previous work : The SEALS Framework [SLE '21]

SEALS: A framework for building Self-Adaptive Virtual Machines 9

- Framework to implement DSLs with self-adaptive operational semantics
- Provides modularity for adaptation definitions



https://inria.hal.science/hal-03355253/document

<sup>9</sup> G. Jouneaux, O. Barais, B. Combemale, *et al.*, "SEALS: A framework for building Self-Adaptive Virtual Machines," in *SLE 2021*, Chicago, United States, Oct. 2021. DOI: 10.1145/3486608.3486912



Adaptive Structural Operational Semantics - Jouneaux et al.

#### The SEALS Framework

Conceptually free the DSL user of :

- Implementing the feedback-loop
- Integrate the execution variants

Concretely helps the DSL designer in :

- Modeling domain concepts
- Adaptation process' specialization



Overview of RobLANG in SEALS



#### The SEALS Framework

Conceptually free the DSL user of :

- Implementing the feedback-loop
- Integrate the execution variants

Concretely helps the DSL designer in :

- Modeling domain concepts
- Adaptation process' specialization

However, it remains hard to reason over the operational semantics



Overview of RobLANG in SEALS



Adaptive Structural Operational Semantics		
•00		

A metalanguage to specify and reason on self-adaptable operational semantics



Adaptive Structural Operational Semantics  $\circ \bullet \circ$ 

ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

#### Adaptive Structural Operational Semantics

Defined as an extension of MSOS <sup>10</sup> :

- Metalanguage to define Operational Semantics
- Modular definition of semantic rules
- Ability to verify properties such as determinism, completeness or termination

Extended by providing additional adaptation rules and how to introduce them

Generation of a SEALS implementation for execution

<sup>10</sup> P. D. Mosses, "Modular structural operational semantics," *The Journal of Logic and Algebraic Programming*, vol. 60, pp. 195–228, 2004



Syntax ASOS Se

emantics

ation

Conclusion

#### Approach overview

Language definition using ASOS :

- Abstract syntax as metamodel
- Semantics rules in ASOS
- Feedback-loop configuration

ASOS semantics components :

- A "default" semantics
- Adaptation semantics
- Pointcuts for adaptation semantics





ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

#### Semantic rules in ASOS

```
model RobLANG.ecore with sd
2
3
  rule program,
       Program(command) -> Program(newcommand)
5
  resolve
       command -> newcommand
   rule program error,
       Program(command) -> sd.RuntimeError()
  resolve
11
       command -> termination sd.RuntimeError()
12
13
   rule assign set,
       Assignment(name, sd.Integer(n))
14
15
       ->
16
       sd. NilValue()
  bind
18
       self.value = sd.Integer(n)
```

```
1 rule if_then,

2 If(sd.Boolean(b), c1, c2) -> c1

3 where

4 b == true
```

 Model merging metamodel and dynamic information



ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

```
model Bobl ANG ecore with sd
2
  rule program.
       Program(command) -> Program(newcommand)
  resolve
       command -> newcommand
8
   rule program error.
       Program(command) -> sd.RuntimeError()
  resolve
11
       command -> termination sd.RuntimeError()
12
13
   rule assign set.
14
       Assignment(name, sd.Integer(n))
15
       ->
16
       sd.NilValue()
17
  bind
18
       self.value = sd.Integer(n)
```

```
1 rule if_then,

2 If (sd.Boolean(b), c1, c2) -> c1

3 where

4 b == true
```

- Model merging metamodel and dynamic information
- A set of semantic rules
  - Conclusion as transition between concepts
  - Transition premises
  - Binding computed values
  - Side condition



ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

```
model Bobl ANG ecore with sd
2
3
  rule program.
       Program(command) -> Program(newcommand)
  resolve
       command -> newcommand
8
   rule program error.
       Program(command) -> sd.RuntimeError()
  resolve
11
       command -> termination sd.RuntimeError()
12
13
   rule assign set.
14
       Assignment(name, sd.Integer(n))
15
       ->
16
       sd.NilValue()
17
  bind
18
       self.value = sd.Integer(n)
```

```
1 rule if_then,

2 If (sd.Boolean(b), c1, c2) -> c1

3 where

4 b == true
```

- Model merging metamodel and dynamic information
- A set of semantic rules
  - Conclusion as transition between concepts
  - Transition premises
  - Binding computed values
  - Side condition



ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

```
model RobLANG.ecore with sd
2
3
  rule program.
       Program(command) -> Program(newcommand)
5
  resolve
6
       command -> newcommand
   rule program error,
       Program(command) -> sd.RuntimeError()
  resolve
       command -> termination sd.RuntimeError()
12
13
   rule assign set,
14
       Assignment(name, sd.Integer(n))
15
       ->
16
       sd. NilValue()
  bind
18
       self.value = sd.Integer(n)
```

```
1 rule if_then,

2 If (sd.Boolean(b), c1, c2) -> c1

3 where

4 b == true
```

- Model merging metamodel and dynamic information
- A set of semantic rules
  - Conclusion as transition between concepts
  - Transition premises
  - Binding computed values
  - Side condition



ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

```
model Bobl ANG ecore with sd
2
3
  rule program.
       Program(command) -> Program(newcommand)
5
  resolve
6
       command -> newcommand
   rule program error.
       Program(command) -> sd.RuntimeError()
  resolve
       command -> termination sd.RuntimeError()
12
13
   rule assign set.
14
       Assignment(name, sd.Integer(n))
15
       ->
16
       sd.NilValue()
  bind
18
       self.value = sd.Integer(n)
```

```
1 rule if_then,
2 If(sd.Boolean(b), c1, c2) -> c1
3 where
4 b == true
```

- Model merging metamodel and dynamic information
- A set of semantic rules
  - Conclusion as transition between concepts
  - Transition premises
  - Binding computed values
  - Side condition



ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluatio

Conclusion

```
model RobLANG.ecore with sd
2
3
  rule program.
       Program(command) -> Program(newcommand)
5
  resolve
       command -> newcommand
   rule program error,
       Program(command) -> sd.RuntimeError()
  resolve
       command -> termination sd.RuntimeError()
12
13
   rule assign set,
14
       Assignment(name, sd.Integer(n))
15
       ->
16
       sd. NilValue()
  bind
18
       self.value = sd.Integer(n)
```

```
1 rule if_then,
2 If(sd.Boolean(b), c1, c2) -> c1
3 where
4 b == true
```

- Model merging metamodel and dynamic information
- A set of semantic rules
  - Conclusion as transition between concepts
  - Transition premises
  - Binding computed values
  - Side condition



ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

```
model RobLANG.ecore with sd
2
3
  rule program.
       Program(command) -> Program(newcommand)
5
  resolve
       command -> newcommand
   rule program error,
       Program(command) -> sd.RuntimeError()
  resolve
       command -> termination sd.RuntimeError()
12
13
   rule assign set,
14
       Assignment(name, sd.Integer(n))
15
       ->
16
       sd. NilValue()
  bind
18
       self.value = sd.Integer(n)
```

```
1 rule if_then,

2 If(sd.Boolean(b), c1, c2) -> c1

3 <u>where</u>

4 b == true
```

- Model merging metamodel and dynamic information
- A set of semantic rules
  - Conclusion as transition between concepts
  - Transition premises
  - Binding computed values
  - Side condition



ASOS Syntax 000

#### Expressing adaptations

```
ApproximateDouble {
 2
 3
       match Assignement (VarRef (def), expr)
       where def.type == Float
 5
       Before binop rhs rule binop lhs to float,
           Binop(sd.Double(n1), a2)
 8
           ->
 9
           Binop(sd.Float(n1), a2)
10
       Before binop compute rule
       binop rhs to float.
12
           Binop(Number(n1), sd.Double(n2))
13
           ->
14
           Binop(Number(n1), sd.Float(n2))
15 }
```

Matching definition Structural matching Additional constraints

#### Adaptation rules

- Kind of adaptation rule
- Affected rule in semantics
- Adaptation semantic rule



11

ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

#### Expressing adaptations

```
ApproximateDouble {
2
 3
       match Assignement (VarRef (def), expr)
       where def.type == Float
 5
       Before binop rhs rule binop lhs to float,
           Binop(sd.Double(n1), a2)
8
           ->
9
           Binop(sd.Float(n1), a2)
10
11
       Before binop compute rule
       binop rhs to float.
12
           Binop(Number(n1), sd.Double(n2))
13
           ->
14
           Binop(Number(n1), sd.Float(n2))
15 }
```

- Matching definition
  - Structural matching
  - Additional constraints

#### Adaptation rules

- Kind of adaptation rule
- Affected rule in semantics
- Adaptation semantic rule



ASOS Syntax 000

#### Expressing adaptations

```
ApproximateDouble {
 2
 3
       match Assignement (VarRef (def), expr)
       where def.type == Float
 5
       Before binop rhs rule binop lhs to float,
           Binop(sd.Double(n1), a2)
 8
           ->
 9
           Binop(sd.Float(n1), a2)
10
       Before binop compute rule
       binop rhs to float.
12
           Binop(Number(n1), sd.Double(n2))
13
           ->
14
           Binop(Number(n1), sd.Float(n2))
15 }
```

- Matching definition
  - Structural matching
  - Additional constraints

#### Adaptation rules

- Kind of adaptation rule
- Affected rule in semantics
- Adaptation semantic rule



11

ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

#### Expressing adaptations

```
ApproximateDouble {
2
 3
       match Assignement (VarRef (def), expr)
       where def.type == Float
 5
 6
       Before binop rhs rule binop lhs to float,
           Binop(sd.Double(n1), a2)
8
           ->
9
           Binop(sd.Float(n1), a2)
10
11
       Before binop compute rule
       binop rhs to float.
12
           Binop(Number(n1), sd.Double(n2))
13
           ->
14
           Binop(Number(n1), sd.Float(n2))
15 }
```

- Matching definition
  - Structural matching
  - Additional constraints

#### Adaptation rules

- Kind of adaptation rule
- Affected rule in semantics
- Adaptation semantic rule



ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

#### The Metamodel of ASOS





ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

#### The Metamodel of ASOS





ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

#### The Metamodel of ASOS





ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

#### The Metamodel of ASOS





Adaptive Structural Operational Semantics

ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

#### The Metamodel of ASOS





ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

#### The Metamodel of ASOS





ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

#### The Metamodel of ASOS





ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

#### The Metamodel of ASOS





**ASOS Formal Semantics** 

 $\pi(\gamma)(\kappa(\text{source}(X))) = D'$ Get the set of activated adaptations

 $\zeta(\mathsf{D} \cup \mathsf{D}') = \delta'$ Select the adaptations to perform

 $\mathsf{D} \diamond \mathsf{D}' \vdash (\gamma, \delta') \leadsto \gamma'$ There is a valid adaptation transition to  $\gamma'$ 

 $D \diamond D' \vdash (\gamma, \delta') \not\rightsquigarrow$ There is no valid adaptation transition

 $\mathsf{D}\diamond\mathsf{D'}\vdash\gamma\longrightarrow\gamma'$ Apply the default semantics

$$\begin{aligned} \pi(\gamma)(\kappa(source(X))) &= D'\\ \zeta(D\cup D') &= \delta'\\ \underline{D\diamond D' \vdash (\gamma, \delta') \rightsquigarrow \gamma'}\\ \underline{D \vdash \gamma \twoheadrightarrow \gamma'} \end{aligned}$$

ASOS Semantics

$$\begin{aligned} \pi(\gamma)(\kappa(source(X))) &= D' \\ \zeta(D \cup D') &= \delta' \\ D \diamond D' \vdash (\gamma, \delta') \not\leftrightarrow \\ \underline{D \diamond D' \vdash \gamma \longrightarrow \gamma'} \\ \underline{D \vdash \gamma \twoheadrightarrow \gamma'} \end{aligned}$$

d

## **ASOS Formal Semantics**

 $\pi(\gamma)(\kappa(\text{source}(X))) = D'$ Get the set of activated adaptations

 $\zeta(\mathsf{D} \cup \mathsf{D}') = \delta'$ Select the adaptations to perform

 $\mathsf{D} \diamond \mathsf{D}' \vdash (\gamma, \delta') \leadsto \gamma'$ There is a valid adaptation transition to  $\gamma'$ 

 $\mathsf{D} \diamond \mathsf{D}' \vdash (\gamma, \delta') \not\leadsto$ There is no valid adaptation transition

 $\mathsf{D} \diamond \mathsf{D}' \vdash \gamma \longrightarrow \gamma'$ Apply the default semantics

$$\begin{aligned} \pi(\gamma)(\kappa(source(X))) &= D'\\ \zeta(D \cup D') &= \delta'\\ \underline{D \diamond D' \vdash (\gamma, \delta') \rightsquigarrow \gamma'}\\ \underline{D \vdash \gamma \twoheadrightarrow \gamma'} \end{aligned}$$

ASOS Semantics

$$\begin{aligned} \pi(\gamma)(\kappa(source(X))) &= D' \\ \zeta(D \cup D') &= \delta' \\ D \diamond D' \vdash (\gamma, \delta') \not\leadsto \\ \underline{D \diamond D' \vdash \gamma \longrightarrow \gamma'} \\ \underline{D \vdash \gamma \twoheadrightarrow \gamma'} \end{aligned}$$

#### For more detail : Take a look at the paper !

d



Adaptive Structural Operational Semantics - Jouneaux et al.

Adaptive Structural Operational Semantics

SOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

#### **ASOS Translational Semantics**



General pattern of translation from ASOS rules to SEALS Operation in Java

Adaptive Structural Operational Semantics

ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

#### Execution of an ASOS Rule (1)



Execution of the feedback loop and activation of adaptations



Adaptive Structural Operational Semantics

ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

#### Execution of an ASOS Rule (2)



Execution of the matching system and call of rules



ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation • 0 Conclusior

## Evaluation

We provide proof for :

- Determinism
- Completeness

On non-termination :

- Patterns can be detected
- Currently over estimate

Applicability on the Roblang DSL :

- Adaptations proposed affect correctly the behavior of the robot
- Adaptations are correctly selected depending on the context



ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

#### Performance

We compare ASOS to self-adaptation defined in the program

Experimental setup :

- Experimented on 31Gb of RAM, i7-10850H and OpenJDK 11.0.18
- 30 executions in a row
- Repeated 3 times with reboot mitigating effects of the initial state<sup>12</sup>.

Results :

- Speedups ranging from x0.80 to 0.95 (Geometrical Mean of x0.88).
- Probably due to JVM optimizations of the feedback loop in Java

<sup>12</sup> T. Kalibera, L. Bulej, and P. Tuma, "Benchmark precision and random initial state," in *Proceedings of the 2005 International Symposium on Performance Evaluation of Computer and Telecommunication Systems (SPECTS 2005)*, 2005, pp. 484–490



Adaptive Structural Operational Semantics - Jouneaux et al.

ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluatior

Conclusion

#### Conclusion

The ASOS metalanguage provides :

- Abstractions for defining operational semantics adaptations
- Mechanism for composing adaptations with the default semantics
- Support for verifying properties (e.g. determinism) of operational semantics

Technical aspects :

- IDE tool support for ASOS
- Generator targeting the SEALS Framework
- Compatible with Xtext

ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluati oo Conclusion

#### Perspectives

Evaluate the complexity of using the ASOS metalanguage

- Reify SEALS correctness envelope at the rule level
- Extend ASOS to formally configure the feedback loop
- Use ASOS declarative nature to support SALs composition



Adaptive Structural Operational Semantics

ASOS Syntax

ASOS Semantics

Evaluation

Conclusion

## Thanks for your attention!



https://www.gwendal-jouneaux.fr/assets/pdf/ASOS\_SLE2023.pdf



Adaptive Structural Operational Semantics - Jouneaux et al.